The Educational Experiences of American Families During the COVID-19 Pandemic: Nationally Representative Panel Survey Evidence

Presented by: Anna Rosefsky Saavedra, Research Scientist
University of Southern California, Dornsife Center for Economic and Social Research
In collaboration with: Marshall Garland, Shira Korn Haderlein, Morgan Polikoff, Amie Rapaport, and Daniel Silver

We gratefully acknowledge financial support for this research from the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation and the National Science Foundation Grants No.2037179 and 2120194. Any opinions, findings, and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this material are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation or the National Science Foundation.
The Understanding America Study

• Since 2014, longitudinal, national probability-based panel of approximately 8,500 US residents, collecting information at multiple time points each year on economic, labor, attitudinal, and health measures, etc.

• Tracking pandemic effects starting March 10, 2020

• Every day ~500 respondents answer UAS questions, 7000 over a two-week period
We Conduct Surveys Online, and Provide Internet-Connected Tablets...

...to people who didn’t have Internet access before, permitting participation among older, lower income, lower education, rural, unemployed, and/or disabled participants, making the UAS truly representative of the US population.
## ~1,400 UAS Households With Minimum One K-12 Child

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race/ethnicity</th>
<th>UAS April 2020 (percent)</th>
<th>Current Population Survey (percent)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>61.4</td>
<td>55.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>11.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>18.5</td>
<td>22.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education level</th>
<th>UAS April 2020 (percent)</th>
<th>Current Population Survey (percent)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High school or less</td>
<td>35.8</td>
<td>36.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some college</td>
<td>29.0</td>
<td>27.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baccalaureate or higher</td>
<td>35.2</td>
<td>36.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age category</th>
<th>UAS April 2020 (percent)</th>
<th>Current Population Survey (percent)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18-30</td>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>24.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-45</td>
<td>56.1</td>
<td>48.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46-65</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>24.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66+</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
14 Waves of Survey Administration Data (and Counting)

Apr 1-29
Apr 15-May 12
Apr 29-May 26
Jun 24-Jul 21
Sep 30-Oct 28
Nov '20-June '21
Apr 14-May 11

Nearly all states close schools for the academic year
26 States Have Closed Schools For The Year Amid Coronavirus Outbreak

Students speak out: Distance learning has challenged me
Failing The Fall: School reopening mandate draws concerns, confusion from parents and school districts

Research Finds Few Links Between Schools And COVID

More non-white than white parents prefer remote learning for their children
At the beginning of the pandemic, we found large disparities in educational experiences
In April 2020, more than one-third of low-income families lacked access to computers and internet. The chart shows the percentage of children having access to internet and laptop/desktop for learning based on household income:

- Less than $25K: 63%
- $25K–$49K: 87%
- $50K–$74K: 91%
- $75K–$149K: 91%
- Greater than $150K: 98%
In the summer, parents shared their preferences for the fall
Remote-only Learning Had Parents’ Least *Overall* Support

Q: Schools are considering several policies in the wake of recent school closures. Do you oppose or support each of the following policies?

- Keep schools closed, remote only: 43%
- Extend the next school year: 44%
- Open schools, wear face coverings: 45%
- Open schools with 2 shifts: 61%
- Begin by re-teaching end of last year: 64%
- Offer options – remote or in-person: 74%
But More Parents of Color Wanted Remote Learning

![Bar chart showing the percentage of parents of different races who wanted remote learning. Orange bars represent Black, blue for Total, and brown for Hispanic. The percentages are as follows: Total 43%, White 32%, Black 64%, Hispanic 50%, and Asian 73%.](image-url)
By October 2020, some parents reported improvements over the spring, though with a long way to go.
In October Nearly 70 Percent of Children Were Learning Fully or Partially Remotely—with Rates Differing by Many Factors

% of Households with Children Attending School Fully or Partially Remotely

Race/Ethnicity

- Black: 81
- Asian: 81
- Hispanic: 78
- White: 61

Income

- <$25K HH income: 71
- $25-49K HH income: 62

US Region

- Western: 87
- Northeast: 64
- South: 64
- Midwest: 59

Urbanicity

- Urban: 81
- Rural: 53

Grade

- High School: 74
- Elementary: 61

Polit. ID

- Democrat: 80
- Republican: 54

Average = 68
Overall Parents’ Grades for School Quality Improved, But Not So Much Among Remote

Parents' Grades for School's Overall Quality of Education

Grade (GPA scale: A=4, F=0)

Pre-COVID       Spring       Fall

In-person in fall       Remote in fall       Hybrid in fall

University of Southern California
Same Pattern for Science Instruction Quality Grades

Parents' Grades for School's Science Instruction Quality

Grade (GPA scale: A=4, F=0)

- In-person in fall
- Remote in fall
- Hybrid in fall
...And for Math

Parents' Grades for School's Math Instruction Quality

Grade (GPA scale: A=4, F=0)

Pre-COVID
Spring
Fall

In-person in fall
Remote in fall
Hybrid in fall
Concern About Remote-Learning Children’s Emotional Health Increased Since the Summer

Parents' Concern for Child, Emotionally

- In-person in fall
- Remote in fall
- Hybrid in fall

% of Parents
Schools were delivering more services than in April, but not at pre-COVID-19 levels
Widespread Parent Support for Mask-Wearing in Schools

Support for mandatory mask wearing in schools, by racial group

- **HISPANIC**
  - October: 75%
  - Summer: 47%

- **ASIAN**
  - October: 85%
  - Summer: 49%

- **BLACK**
  - October: 82%
  - Summer: 45%

- **WHITE**
  - October: 62%
  - Summer: 43%

October
Summer
US Parents Show Relatively High, Uniform Support for Cancelling Standardized Tests in Spring 2021

Data from October 2020 administration of the UAS

Average = 64%

Race/Ethnicity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race/Ethnicity</th>
<th>% in Support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Income

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Income</th>
<th>% in Support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Less than $25k</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$25k-$49k</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$50k-$74k</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$75k-$149k</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$150k or more</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Political ID

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Political ID</th>
<th>% in Support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dem/Lean Dem</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rep/Lean Rep</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Attendance Mode

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attendance Mode</th>
<th>% in Support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fully in Person</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hybrid</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fully Remote</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
November 2020 through April 2021 (and until June ‘21) we have been collecting data on child attendance mode, parent preferences, school mitigation strategies
White Parents’ Winter-Spring 2021 School Attendance Preferences

Race–ethnicity = White – National sample; 7-day window; Parent’s race–ethnicity; ‘Other’ responses not shown

USC Dornsife
Center for Economic and Social Research

University of Southern California
Black Parents’ Winter-Spring 2021 School Attendance Preferences

Race-ethnicity = Black – National sample; 7-day window; Parent’s race-ethnicity; ‘Other’ responses not shown

Graph showing trends in school attendance preferences over time, with categories for in-person, remote, hybrid, and unsure attendance options.
Hispanic Parents’ Winter-Spring 2021 School Attendance Preferences

Race–ethnicity = Hispanic – National sample; 7–day window; Parent’s race–ethnicity; ‘Other’ responses not shown

USC Dornsife Center for Economic and Social Research
University of Southern California
Press and Publications April 2020-March 2021

- Brookings Brown Center Chalkboard article on how almost everyone is concerned about K-12 students’ academic progress (December 2020-February 2021 data)
- Economist article on how more non-white than white parents prefer remote learning for their children (January-February 2021 data)
- Los Angeles Times article on how parents struggle with a new dilemma: Is it safe to send kids back to school? (January-February 2021 data)
- Los Angeles Times article on how a high school reopened two months ago, with no COVID-19 outbreaks? (January-February 2021 data)
- EDsource article on how California parents continue to disagree on return to school as Covid-19 cases decline (January-February 2021 data)
- Economist article on why reopening schools in minority neighbourhoods is hard (January-February 2021 data)
- Chalkbeat article on whether parents are getting the type of instruction they want for their kids (January-February 2021 data)
- New Yorker article on what’s at stake in the fight over reopening schools (January-February 2021 data)
- New York Times article on how Rhode Island kept its schools open (January-February 2021 data)
- Los Angeles Times article on how schools in more affluent areas move faster to reopen than those in low-income communities (January-February 2021 data)
- Education Next blog on mask-wearing in schools (November 2020 data)
- Evidence Base article on evidence of COVID-19’s impact on K-12 education and critical areas of intervention (April-October 2020 data)
- Brookings piece on fall 2020 differences between in-person and remote learning experiences (September 30-October 28 2020 data)
- Evidence Project piece on needed supports for remote learners (September 30-October 28 2020 data)
- 74 Million piece on decrease in parent support for standardized testing in spring 2021 (September 30-October 28 2020 data)
- Hechinger Op-Ed with recommendations for policy makers about school re-openings (September 30-October 28 2020 data)
- USC blog on parents’ concerns and perspectives on school reopening (June 22-July 24 2020 data)
- EdWeek (exclusive) article on K12 parents’ concerns and preferences (June 22-July 24 2020 data)
- FutureEd blog on parents’ conversations about race with their children (June 22-July 24 2020 data)
- Beyond Policing we must also address Black-White educational disparities (April/May 2020 data)
- Conversation article describing inequitable student access to computers and internet necessary for online learning (April 2020 data)
- EdWeek article (exclusive) article on K12 parents’ concerns from the end of April (April 2020 data)
Ongoing Work

• Continuing to track children’s attendance mode, options their schools are offering, and school in-person safety precautions through June

• New surveys in April, June, October 2021

• Linking education data to the full UAS dataset and COVID case, hospitalization, death, vaccine rates

• Continuing to publish results in education and mainstream press, prepare papers for peer-reviewed publication

• Stay tuned!
UAS Data Available for Free Download:
uasdata.usc.edu/education
Remote learner needs have included one computer per child, acceptable internet service, meals and mental health support (as well as tutoring, parent homework support, child care)

Remote learning attendance varied considerably nationwide through the year, as did parent views on education quality

Wide variation by race and household income in parents’ attendance mode preferences for their children—concerns of ongoing “school hesitancy”
Thank you!

Anna Rosefsky Saavedra, Research Scientist & NSF RAPID PI
University of Southern California Dornsife Center for Economic and Social Research
asaavedr@usc.edu
213-219-3217

In collaboration with: Marshall Garland, Shira Korn Haderlein, Morgan Polikoff, Amie Rapaport, and Daniel Silver
Greater Proportions of Remote Parents Report Their Child is Unprepared in Science

Parents Reporting their Child is Academically Unprepared in Science, by Fall Attendance Mode

- In person in fall
- Remote in fall
- Hybrid in fall

Summer 2020
Fall 2020

% of Parents
Greater Proportions of Remote Parents Report Their Child is Unprepared in Math

Parents Reporting their Child is Academically Unprepared in Math, by Fall Attendance Mode

- In person in fall
- Remote in fall
- Hybrid in fall

Greater Proportions of Remote Parents Report Their Child is Unprepared in Math
Greater Proportions of Remote Parents Report Their Child is Unprepared in ELA as well

Parents Reporting their Child is Academically Unprepared in ELA, by Fall Attendance Mode

![Graph showing the percentage of parents reporting their child is academically unprepared in ELA, by fall attendance mode. The graph indicates that greater proportions of remote parents report their child is unprepared in ELA compared to in-person and hybrid attendance modes.](image-url)
Remote Learners Need Tutoring, More Supports for Parents, More Computers, Better Internet

• Nearly 40 percent of parents reporting their children need tutoring say their schools did not provide it

• Roughly half of parents with a high school degree (or less) feel equipped to help their own children with homework, math 51%, science 58%

• While computer/device provision has improved, 3.5% of remote learners do not have a device for learning—nearly one in ten share

• While just over one percent of families do not have internet access, 22% report continuous internet interruptions, 40% for lowest income (<$25K)

• More than one in ten families with remote learners have formed “pods” where students learn together in-person with the help of a tutor or teacher, 15% among families with household income less than $50K
Almost Everyone is Concerned about K-12 Students’ Academic Progress

Public concern about academic progress of low-income K-12 children

![Bar chart showing public concern by income level and age group.](chart.png)

Source: USC Dornsife Center for Economic and Social Research's Understanding America Survey.
Note: Data collected between Dec. 16-Feb. 7 from a nationally representative sample of U.S. adults.
Results and Policy Implications

• Remote learning attendance differs nationwide
  – Remote learning is inferior so we know which groups of students are most in need

• Remote learner needs include tutoring, parent homework support, one computer per child, acceptable internet service, child care
  – We know some areas to bolster supports

• Special service provision is not back to pre-COVID levels including for meals and mental health support
  – We know some more areas to bolster supports

• Parents’ support for mask-wearing in schools increased since summer
  – Physically opening schools is complicated but increased parent support for mask-wearing is promising

• Parents’ support for cancelling standardized tests increased since spring
  – Standardized testing will need to be targeted, with attention paid to messaging for parents

• In spring 2021, white and higher-income parents want to send children back to school in person, while families of color and lower-income families have been more cautious
  – Sharing these trends is critical to informing national reopening dialogues