Abstract.—The respiratory enzyme cytochrome c oxidase (COX) is composed of subunits encoded by both nuclear and mitochondrial genes; thus, COX activity reflects, to some extent, the coordinated function of the two genomes. Because extensive mtDNA differentiation exists between populations of the copepod Tigriopus californicus, we hypothesized that laboratory hybridizations that disrupt natural combinations of nuclear and mitochondrial genes might negatively impact COX activity. Although experimental results varied greatly among different crosses, replicate sets of crosses between two particular populations showed consistent evidence for nuclear-cytoplasmic coadaptation.

Key words.—Coadaptation, copepod, cytochrome c oxidase, enzyme activity, introgression, nuclear-cytoplasmic interactions, Tigriopus californicus.

Received March 29, 1999. Accepted June 15, 1999.

Several proteins functioning in the mitochondrial electron-transport chain are composed of subunits encoded by both nuclear and mitochondrial genomes. Proper function of such proteins presumably requires regulatory and functional coordination among subunits and may therefore result in selection favoring intergenomic coadaptation (Attardi and Schatz 1988). The enzyme cytochrome c oxidase (COX), which catalyzes the final step in the electron transport chain, is an example of such a protein. In eukaryotes, COX is composed of three subunits encoded by mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) and numerous subunits (10 in mammals; Capaldi 1996) encoded by nuclear DNA. A number of lines of evidence suggest that coadaptation has occurred between nuclear and mitochondrial subunits and/or between the COX subunits and cytochrome c (nuclear encoded). For example, Liepens and Hennen (1977) transplanted single nuclei from one frog species into enucleated eggs of a congener and found that normal COX activity required mtDNA plus at least a haploid complement of nuclear DNA from the same species. Work by Osheroff et al. (1983; reviewed by Cann et al. 1984) showed that primate cytochrome c reacts better with primate COX than with nonprimate COX. King and Attardi (1989) introduced mitochondria from different human cell lines into a common host cell line depleted of mitochondria and found that the level of COX activity varied with the source of the mitochondria. This latter study was the first to suggest that nuclear/mitochondrial coadaptation may occur within a species, but the experimental analysis was far removed from the intact organism.

In this study, we test for gene interactions affecting COX function by manipulating cytonuclear genotypes via laboratory crosses between conspecific populations. The study system consists of a series of genetically differentiated populations of the marine copepod Tigriopus californicus. Both allozyme and DNA studies have shown extensive genetic differentiation among T. californicus populations, even over distances as small as 10 km (e.g., Burton and Feldman 1981; Burton 1998). This differentiation appears to be temporally stable (Burton 1997), suggesting that natural populations of this species have long, independent evolutionary histories. Such highly structured populations provide the opportunity for the evolution of coadapted gene complexes (Burton et al. 1999).

When T. californicus populations are hybridized in the laboratory, F1 offspring are typically similar to their parents for a variety of physiological and developmental traits, whereas F2 offspring show reduced resistance to osmotic stress (Burton 1986, 1990a) and increased development time (Burton 1987, 1990b). These results suggest that populations have evolved different systems of positively interacting genes (e.g., coadapted gene complexes) that are disrupted by segregation and recombination in the F2 generation. Interpopulation comparisons of both COX1 (Burton and Lee 1994) and cytochrome c (Burton et al. 1999) show extensive DNA sequence divergence and moderate levels of inferred amino acid divergence. Using a simple spectrophotometric assay, Edmands and Burton (1998) showed that isofemale lines of T. californicus cultured under common-garden conditions had significant variation in COX activity levels both within and between populations, indicating a heritable component to COX activity variation. However, reciprocal crosses between lines indicated that patterns of inheritance of COX activity were complex. In interpopulation crosses, F1 offspring generally had COX activities similar to or higher than the parents, whereas F2 offspring had enzyme activities below the parents, suggesting that strong nuclear-nuclear or nuclear-mitochondrial interactions affect COX function.

To better understand the source of gene interactions affecting COX function, we have transplanted nuclear genes from one cytoplasmic background to another by hybridization followed by repeatedly backcrossing females to males from...
the paternal population. In theory, each generation of backcrossing will replace half of the maternal nuclear genome with the paternal nuclear genome (Fig. 1). If nuclear-nuclear interactions predominate, then deviations from expectations based on purely additive gene action should be greatest in the earliest generations of hybridization because animals will lack complete nuclear sets of coadapted alleles from either parental population. In contrast, if nuclear-mitochondrial interactions predominate, then deviations should be greatest in the later generations of hybridization, when the entire nuclear genome has been replaced by a foreign nuclear genome to which the mitochondrial genome is not coadapted. As a control, F₁ hybrid females were also repeatedly backcrossed to males from the maternal population, effectively restoring the original maternal cytonuclear environment. The five populations used in this study are substantially different genetically, with up to 23% sequence divergence for a segment of the mitochondrial COI gene (see Burton and Lee 1994; Burton 1998). Because hybridization among these populations may have consequences for many traits besides COX function, we also estimated total fitness for a subset of the lines.

**Materials and Methods**

**Copepod Cultures**

Natural populations of *T. californicus* were sampled from high intertidal rock pools in five locations in California: Santa Cruz (SC, 36°57′N, 122°03′W), Abalone Cove (AB, 33°44′N, 118°22′W), Royal Palms (RP, 33°43′N, 118°19′W), Laguna Beach (LB, 33°33′N, 117°47′W), and San Diego (SD, 32°45′N, 117°15′W). Animals were maintained as mass cultures (300 or more adults) in 400-ml beakers. All cultures were kept at 15 ± 2°C with a 12:12 L:D photoperiod. The cross between populations SC and AB appeared to show strong nuclear-mitochondrial interactions. To test for the effects of within-population mitochondrial variation, isofemale/isonuclear mitochondrial lines from the AB population were established by isolating single gravid females in petri dishes (15 mm × 100 mm) and inbreeding the resulting offspring which are full-siblings because females mate only once (Burton, 1985). All copepods were maintained in natural seawater supplemented with commercial flake-type fish food.

**Backcrosses**

Interpopulation crosses followed methods in Burton et al. (1981). Crosses were conducted in petri dishes (15 mm × 100 mm) that were monitored three times per week. For each cross, multiple males and virgin females were united in each dish. When F₁ juveniles (copepodids) were first observed, parents were removed from the dish. To distinguish males from females, offspring were left in the same dish until they formed clasped pairs (adult male + virgin female). The pairs were then dissected apart. For the experimental backcross lines, F₁ virgin females were mass mated to males from the paternal population. For the control backcross lines, F₁ virgin females were mass mated to males from the maternal population. Initially, seven crosses were conducted between outbred populations (SC female × AB male and reciprocal crosses between LB and SD, RP and SD, and SC and SD). The choice of crosses was limited by the number of animals in culture; therefore, all reciprocal crosses could not be done. Because the SC × AB cross showed the strongest evidence for nonadditive gene action for COX activity, we focused on further crosses between these two populations. Five isofemale lines from population AB were backcrossed to the SC population. Isofemale lines were used as the maternal parent in these crosses to restrict the effects of mtDNA variation within populations. However, all backcrosses were done to populations (instead of isofemale lines) to avoid confounding the effects of outbreeding with the effects of progressive inbreeding. Crosses were maintained for two to eight backcross generations. The duration of the cross depended on the number of copepods in culture available for mating. For all crosses, COX activity measurements were taken every generation when possible. In some cases, the lines died out prematurely or there were insufficient numbers of animals to allow individuals to be sacrificed in each generation.

**COX Activity Assays**

Activity of cytochrome c oxidase (EC 1.9.3.1) was measured by a standard spectrophotometric assay based on the oxidation of cytochrome c (Simon and Robin 1971). A solution of 400 mg cytochrome c (Type VI from horse heart, Sigma Chemical Co., St. Louis, MO) and 2.4 ml phosphate buffer (50 mM NaH₂PO₄, pH 7.1) was reduced with 40 mg ascorbic acid. The ascorbic acid was then removed by dialysis...
(Slide-A-Lyzer™ cassette, Pierce Chemical Co., Rockford, IL) against phosphate buffer (10°C, overnight, three changes of buffer). The reduced cytochrome c was frozen at −20°C and used within two weeks. Adult copepods were sexed (three categories: male, female, and female with egg sac) and rinsed in filtered seawater. Individual copepods were then homogenized in microcentrifuge tubes in 200 µL ice-cold homogenization buffer (freshly mixed phosphate buffer and 0.05% Tween 80 detergent [polyoxyethylene-20-sorbitan monooctate, Fisher Scientific, Pittsburgh, PA]) for approximately 10 sec using a motorized Delrin plastic pestle fitted to 1.5-ml microcentrifuge tubes. After centrifugation for 5 min at 2000 G, two 40 µL aliquots of the supernatant were distributed into each of two 96-well microtitre plates; one plate was then used for the COX assay and the other was used for the total protein assay. For the COX assays, 160 µL of 51 µM reduced cytochrome c (calculated using the millimolar extinction coefficient of 29.5 at 550 nm) was added to each well and OD550 was measured using a microtitre plate reader (UVmax®, Molecular Devices Corporation, Menlo Park, CA). Plates were incubated at 23 ± 1°C for 30 min and OD550 was remeasured. The duration of the endpoint assay and the concentrations of homogenate and substrate were chosen to yield linear changes in absorption over time. For the total protein assays, 160 µL of bicinchoninic acid reagent (BCA; Pierce Chemical Co.; Smith et al. 1985) was added to each well. Plates were incubated overnight at 37°C and OD562 was measured. Total protein content was determined from comparisons with bovine serum albumin standards run on each plate.

**Fitness Assays**

To estimate fitness, females were removed from the mating dishes as soon as they produced their first egg sac. Each female was placed in a petri dish containing 30 ml filtered seawater and excess food (24 mg finely ground Tetramin fish food). After 30 days at 15°C all surviving nauplii (larvae), copepodids (juveniles), and copepods (adults) were counted.

**Statistical Analyses**

Although enzyme activities are often reported as on a per unit protein basis, this implicitly assumes that a doubling in protein content results in a doubling in activity. Instead, we used analysis of covariance (SUPERANOVA, Abacus Concepts, Berkeley, CA) to adjust for protein content of individual copepods. Analysis of covariance was also used to factor out the effects of sex and microtitre plate. Cytochrome oxidase activity was the dependent variable, sample type (i.e., isofemale line 1, line 1 × line 2 F1 hybrid, etc.) was the main effect, and the covariates were sex, protein content, and the interaction between sample and microtitre plate number.

**Models of Gene Action**

Each generation of backcrossing should, on average, replace half of the maternal nuclear genome with the paternal nuclear genome (Fig. 1). Therefore, after F1 hybridization and three generations of backcrossing, individuals are expected to carry 100% maternal cytoplasm (including mitochondria) and 93.75% paternal nuclear DNA. These numbers are based on three assumptions (Grun 1976): (1) no selection on maternal versus paternal genes; (2) no change in the cytoplasmic factors during the introgression process; and (3) no contribution of cytoplasm by sperm. Further, because there is no recombination in *T. californicus* females (Ar-rushdi 1963; Burton et al. 1981), introgression of paternal nuclear DNA will involve intact chromosomes. Therefore, the expected percent introgression refers to the average of all individuals in the line.

With no maternal effects and no gene interactions, the F1 phenotype should equal the midparent value, P, where P is the average of the sire (S) and the dam (D) phenotypes. In the experimental lines, each generation of backcrossing to the paternal line should bring the phenotype halfway closer to the paternal phenotype: $B_x = P + 1/2(S - P)$, where $x$ is the backcross generation ($F_1 = \text{backcross generation}$). The control lines, each generation of backcrossing to the maternal line should bring the phenotype halfway closer to the maternal phenotype: $B_x = P + 1/2(S - P)$. Deviations from this simple model due to nuclear-cytoplasmic interactions should scale to the proportion of paternal nuclear genes: $1 - (1/2)^x$ in the experimental lines and $(1/2)^x-1$ in the control lines. In contrast, deviations due to nuclear-nuclear interactions should be maximized in the $F_1$ and should be reduced by half with each generation of backcrossing in both the experimental and control lines: $(1/2)^x-1$. We tested the fit to these gene interaction models by regressing deviations from the simple noninteraction model (COX activity − $B_x$) against either $1 - (1/2)^x-1$ or $(1/2)^x-1$.

**Results**

Effects of backcrossing on COX activity varied markedly in crosses between outbred populations (Fig. 2). In the SC female × AB male cross (Fig. 2A), the experimental backcross line had lower COX activity than expected under the additive model, whereas the control cross showed no such deviations. In the RP female × SD male cross (Fig. 2B), there was an initial increase in COX activity followed by a return to expected levels, with no directional change in the control line. In the reciprocal cross (Fig. 2C), there was also little change in the control line, but here there was an erratic decline in COX activity in the experimental line. Reciprocal crosses between LB and SD (Fig. 2D,E) and between SC and SD (Fig. 2F,G) showed no clear trend in COX activity changes over time. In the backcrosses between AB isofemale lines and males from population SC (Fig. 3), all five experimental crosses (each a different mtDNA isolate from the AB population) showed progressive declines in COX activity relative to expectations based on the additive model.

Table 1 shows the extent to which these deviations from expectations under the additive model are explained by nuclear-nuclear or nuclear-cytoplasmic interactions. Deviations from expected levels in the experimental crosses should show a positive correlation with the proportion paternal nuclear genome if nuclear-cytoplasmic interactions predominate and a negative correlation if nuclear-nuclear interactions predom-
Fig. 2. Deviations from expected mean cytochrome c oxidase activity in seven backcrosses between outbred populations. Under the simple additive model, expected activity levels in F1 hybrids are intermediate between the two parents. Each generation of backcrossing then brings expected activity levels halfway closer to the paternal parent in the experimental lines (black ovals) and halfway closer to the maternal parent in the control lines (white rectangles). All crosses are listed as female (dam) × male (sire). Breeding design is shown in Figure 1. Each point represents the mean activity (± SE) for a minimum of three copepods, with ANOVA adjustments for total protein content, gender, and sample × plate interaction.

Fig. 3. Deviations from expected mean cytochrome c oxidase activity in five isofemale lines backcrossed to the paternal population. See caption to Figure 2 for details.
Yet the compact nature of the mitochondrial genome and the known functional importance of its gene products would seem to make such a sweeping assumption tenuous at best. Experimental evidence for nonneutral mtDNA variation has been obtained from a few studies (Clark and Lyckegaard 1988; Rand et al. 1994; Kilpatrick and Rand 1995) that have focused on population-level analyses of cytonuclear hybrids. Here we attempt to directly assess the functional significance of mtDNA variation by monitoring the activity of an enzyme that is partly encoded in both nuclear and mitochondrial genomes. The work itself is made possible by the remarkable genetic structure of the target species *T. californicus*, in which reproductively compatible populations show mtDNA sequence variation exceeding 20% (Burton 1998) and even some highly conserved genes, such as cytochrome *c*, are differentiated at the amino acid level among natural populations (Burton et al. 1999).

The results presented here strongly support the hypothesis of nuclear-mitochondrial coadaptation for a specific pair of populations, SC and AB. Five independent sets of crosses introgressing SC nuclear genes onto an AB cytoplasm (using five different AB isofemale lines for the initial hybridization) yielded nearly identical patterns of progressive decline in COX activity that were not apparent in the control backcrosses. The one set of reciprocal crosses (AB nuclear genes introgressed onto SC cytoplasm) also showed a pronounced decline in COX activity that was not observed in the control backcrosses. These results are unique in demonstrating that a high degree of *intergenomic* coadaptation exists among natural populations of *T. californicus*. Although this coadaptation is evident in the function of COX, we do not yet have evidence that fitness components are affected either by altered COX activity or by other unstudied physiological consequences of nuclear-mitochondrial interactions in the backcrossed lines. The only fitness measure attempted here, productivity of females over a 30-day period, showed an interesting trend of reduced fitness in experimental versus control backcrosses in both generations tested (first and sixth); however, the variance of this measure was too high to make it a reliable fitness estimator. Future work will focus on other types of fitness estimates.

The effects of hybridization on COX activity varied greatly among crosses. In contrast with the consistent pattern presented in the AB × SC crosses, several crosses showed only slight deviations from the additive model and no consistent

### Table 1. Linear regressions of deviation in COX activity from expected additive effects against proportion paternal nuclear genome in hybrid. See text for details. *n* number of generations assayed; *r*, correlation coefficient; ND, no data.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cross</th>
<th>Experimental lines</th>
<th>Control lines</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SC × AB</td>
<td><em>n</em></td>
<td><em>r</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC × AB</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0.378</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RP × SD</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-0.860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD × RP</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LB × SD</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD × LB</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-0.406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC × SD</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.372</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD × SC</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.775</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AB6 × SC</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.740</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AB502 × SC</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AB504 × SC</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AB505 × SC</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.981</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AB509 × SC</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.152</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* *P* < 0.05.

Table 2. Mean number of offspring produced per female in 57 lines of *Tigriopus californicus* and mean COX activity in those same lines. In BIC and B6 (first and sixth generation backcross controls), hybrids were backcrossed to the maternal line, effectively restoring the original maternal cytonuclear environment. Standard errors are in parentheses.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Offspring type</th>
<th>Number of lines</th>
<th>Assays/line</th>
<th>Nauplii</th>
<th>Copepodids</th>
<th>Adults</th>
<th>Total offspring</th>
<th>Mean COX activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>18.60 (2.23)</td>
<td>16.04 (6.19)</td>
<td>7.71 (2.18)</td>
<td>0.28 (0.10)</td>
<td>24.02 (7.43)</td>
<td>99.0 (28.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F1</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>5.11 (0.95)</td>
<td>8.85 (2.96)</td>
<td>14.16 (3.98)</td>
<td>0.93 (0.40)</td>
<td>24.00 (6.09)</td>
<td>8.1 (1.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B1</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6.56 (1.29)</td>
<td>9.91 (2.78)</td>
<td>8.00 (2.10)</td>
<td>0.54 (0.17)</td>
<td>16.51 (4.19)</td>
<td>7.2 (1.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10.00 (2.04)</td>
<td>3.85 (1.29)</td>
<td>3.79 (2.03)</td>
<td>0.41 (0.28)</td>
<td>8.05 (3.06)</td>
<td>4.5 (0.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIC</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11.78 (1.60)</td>
<td>16.43 (4.30)</td>
<td>11.98 (3.88)</td>
<td>2.36 (0.90)</td>
<td>30.77 (8.47)</td>
<td>4.9 (0.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B6C</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.67 (1.20)</td>
<td>12.93 (12.93)</td>
<td>18.83 (17.60)</td>
<td>0.33 (0.33)</td>
<td>32.10 (30.86)</td>
<td>5.0 (1.4)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
pattern with increasing hybridization. One cross showed a trend toward stronger deviations in the earliest generations of backcrossing, a pattern consistent with nuclear-nuclear interactions. This range of results is entirely consistent with the fact that coadaptation, to whatever extent it may occur, takes place independently within each allopatric population. Thus, one cannot predict the extent of genic interactions that may arise when such independent lineages are hybridized.

Similarly, the magnitude of hybridization effects on COX activity was only partially consistent with expectations based on levels of genetic differentiation previously documented between populations. Burton and Lee (1994) showed substantial DNA sequence differentiation in a 500-base segment of the COX mitochondrial subunit I gene (including three inferred amino acid substitutions diagnostic for central California [including SC] vs. southern California populations [including AB and SD]). A nuclear gene encoding histone H1 showed a similar pattern of differentiation between central and southern *T. californicus* populations (Burton and Lee 1994). More recently, DNA sequence data for the nuclear gene cytochrome c (Burton et al. 1999) also shows three amino acid substitutions between these two regions (SC vs. [AB and SD]). Based on these data we might expect the strongest gene interactions in crosses between central and southern California populations (AB/SC and SC/SD). Although strong deviations were found in crosses between AB and SC, the SC × SD cross did not show significant deviations from expectations. However, it must be noted that, to date, sequence data on only a portion of one of the three mitochondrial encoded COX subunits are available; the full extent of regional differentiation in COX subunit amino acid sequences is currently under study (Burton et al. 1999). Interestingly, one cross between southern California populations (RP × SD) showed a trend consistent with nuclear-nuclear interactions that increased COX activity in hybrids. Just as negative effects of hybridizing different populations are expected to be unpredictable, occasional positive interactions can be expected (e.g., Charlesworth 1995; Rieseberg 1997).

Although various crosses showed trends consistent with both nuclear-nuclear and nuclear-cytoplasmic interactions, the only significant fit to our models of gene interaction was consistent with nuclear-cytoplasmic interactions. Little is currently known about what gene interactions may be involved. Our measure of COX function, enzyme activity standardized to total protein, depends on both the amount and the activity of the enzyme. Gene interactions affecting COX function may therefore do so via a variety of mechanisms, including changes in mitochondrial number, transcription rate, transcript processing, message stability, translation efficiency, protein stability, or intrinsic catalytic efficiency (Clark and Wang 1994). Furthermore, it should be noted that our ability to detect genomic coadaptation in COX function may have been limited by the COX activity assay itself, in which commercially available cytochrome c from horse heart was used as a substrate. This assay therefore neglects any coadaptation between COX and cytochrome c, a possibility that seems especially likely in light of recent work on patterns of population divergence of COXI, COXII and cytochrome c (Burton and Lee 1994; Burton et al. 1999). Efforts are therefore currently underway to produce usable quantities of cytochrome c from *T. californicus* populations.

The molecular mechanism underlying the nuclear-mitochondrial coadaptation observed between SC and AB populations remains to be determined. Although the catalytic functions of cytochrome c oxidase (electron transfer and proton pumping) are attributed to the mitochondrial subunits, nuclear genes may play a variety of other roles (see Capaldi 1996; Tsukihara et al. 1996). For example, nuclear subunits have been implicated in assembly of the enzyme complex (Capaldi 1990) and they may also play a role in regulation of COX activity (Tsukihara et al. 1996). Intergenomic coadaptation likely involves nuclear genes other than those encoding COX subunits; for example, nuclear genes have been shown to affect COX expression in yeast (Pel et al., 1992). The role of cytochrome c (nuclear encoded) interaction with COX in interspecific studies (Osheroff et al. 1983) suggests that this is another potentially important site for coadaptation. The observed population differentiation of the cytochrome c gene in *T. californicus* (Burton et al. 1999) raises intriguing questions about the extent of enzyme-substrate coadaptation within this species.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

We gratefully acknowledge C. Funk for his efforts in the early development of the COX enzyme assay, P. Moberg and T. Ballard for help with the copepod cultures, and D. Guay for laboratory assistance and for the creation of Figure 1. Helpful critiques of the manuscript were provided by J. Blanchard, C. Lee, E. Metz, and P. Moberg. This study was supported by National Science Foundation grants DEB94-09066 and OCE94-15669 to RSB.

**LITERATURE CITED**


Corresponding Editor: T. Markow